

Grade 8 / Case Study 1

ELA * SMARTER BALANCED PERFORMANCE TASK

ENGLISH LEARNER

Research Question 1

ITEM #2695

Source #4 describes how some people want to eliminate the penny from the United States' economy. Explain how the information in Source #2 adds to the reader's understanding of the potential effects of eliminating pennies in the United States. Give **two** details from Source #2 to support your explanation.

Student Response

ITEM #2695

People did not really like how big they were. Several other versions of the coin were minted before finally producing the familiar Lincoln penny in 1909. Despite its cultural influences the penny is currently under attack. The reason? Because making money also cost money. In 2011, it cost the U.S. mint more than 2.4 cents to produce one penny. This had led many to argue that the penny is inflating the economy and should be eliminated. (Source 2) not only does he believe that it will have an insignificant impact on prices, but whaples seems to think that eliminating the penny will save time too. He asserts that this time saved is even more valuable than eliminating a potential impact on rounding prices.

Analysis

ITEM #2695

The student is able to summarize key ideas from the text based on close reading of texts, as evident in the opening sentence, which is stated in the student's own words. The next five sentences are copied directly from Source #4 without any form of citation. The sixth sentence is also copied directly from Source #4 but is cited as coming from Source #2. The last two sentences are directly copied from Source #2 without any citation or explanation. Because the majority of this answer is copied directly from text, this response received a score of 0.

The student would benefit from instruction and practice unpacking complicated, multi-step prompts like this one to clearly understand what the item is asking the student to do. Additionally, the student would benefit from instruction on how to properly quote and cite evidence and add explanations of how the evidence supports the claim.

Research Question 2 ITEM #2696	All of the sources provide information about the penny. Which source would most likely be relevant to students researching the ways to reduce the cost of producing the penny? Justify your answer and support it with two pieces of information from the sources.
Student Response ITEM #2696	Source 2 would most likely to be relevant to students because not everyone agrees that the penny should be totally eliminated. Many argue that the price rounding cannot be done fairly, and that finding a way to make pennies cheaper is a better approach. Steel which was used to make pennies during world war 2, it would be a cheaper alternative.
Analysis ITEM #2696	The prompt asks students to identify the source most likely to help students who are "researching the ways to reduce the cost of producing the penny." The student is able to identify a source that would be relevant to students; however, it appears as though the student did not entirely understand the prompt because there is no mention of "ways to reduce the cost of producing the penny" (the second part of the prompt). The student does cite a source but it does not align with the evidence presented in the response. The student would benefit from instruction on closely reading and carefully analyzing both the prompt and the sources. Although the student is able to provide evidence to support the inference made, the student does not correctly answer the prompt. This response receives a score of 0.

Research Question 3

ITEM #2697

Look at the claims in the table. Decide if the information in Source #3, Source #4, both sources, or neither source supports each claim. Put an X in the box that identifies the source that supports each claim. There will be only one box selected for each claim.

Student Response

ITEM #2697

KEY
X = student response
✓ = correct response

	SOURCE #3 Give a Penny—Save the Day!	SOURCE #4 The Ever-Changing Penny	Both	Neither
The penny has more value than what it can buy.	X		✓	
Rounding price totals will cause an increase in prices.			X	✓
The low value of a penny is a good thing.	✓		X	
Changing the metals in the penny is a possible solution for people who want to keep the penny.		✓		X

Analysis

ITEM #2697

This student receives a score of 0 for the response. The student does not complete any of the cells correctly. This student would benefit from instruction on understanding the relationship between a claim and supporting evidence, as well as close reading of the prompt.

Full Write * ITEM #2698**Full Write –
Student
Response**
ITEM #2698

Pennies should still live because lets say that you have five dollars and you need change for one penny where you going to get that one penny if that doesn't exist and plus if you eliminate pennies people will go nuts and pennies have been around for 200 years you cant just throw something away that's been part of our lives for 200 years, Im on both sides but mostly on keeping the pennies instead of eliminating them. The coin also gave rise to the terms like "penny candy" a piece of candy sold for one cent and penny arcade an amusement center with machines that cost one cent to operate. This amazing effort was made possible due to the power of the penny. Many people do not see the value in the penny, and they feel as though pennies are not worth the trouble of carrying them around. Pennies might be a little bulky, but they add up moreover, because they are worth so little, people don't mind donating them to charity.

**Analysis of
Full Write**
ITEM #2698**Organization and Purpose: Score 1**

Based on the Organization and Purpose Rubric, this student receives a score of 1. The student's position is clear but the support for the claim is not logically argued. The student applies an expanding understanding of the organizational features of arguments, but could use additional support in understanding how to support a claim with evidence from various sources. Additionally, the student applies a growing understanding of how to link ideas and reasons within a text through the use of transitions (also, but, because). The student could use additional support in understanding how to use transitions to connect evidence to the central claim as well as how to correctly cite evidence (the latter half of the student's writing consists of a series of uncited quotations). The student demonstrates a basic understanding of how to introduce the topic; additional instructional support could include instruction on how to strengthen an argument through the use of different verbs (could, should, must) and specific examples. The student includes a counter-claim but could again benefit from instructional support on citing quotations. Finally, instruction should address how to craft an effective conclusion.

Evidence/Elaboration: Score 1

Based upon the Evidence/Elaboration Rubric, this student receives a score of 1. The student includes several pieces of evidence to support the claim, and justifies opinions by providing some textual evidence. The student would benefit from instruction on how to elaborate on evidence and make connections to the central claim in order to integrate evidence into a coherent argument. The student demonstrates an emerging understanding of how to select language resources that are appropriate for this audience and purpose, and would benefit from instruction on the difference between formal and informal word choice. For example, the student would benefit from seeing examples of words and phrases used in a formal argument contrasted with phrases such as, "Pennies should still live," and "People will go nuts."

CONTINUED ON PAGE 5

CONTINUED FROM PAGE 4

**Full Write –
Student
Response****ITEM #2698
(CONTINUED)****Conventions: Score 0**

Based upon the Conventions Rubric, this student earns a score of 0. Only the first half of the response is considered when assigning a score, since the latter half is copied text. The student demonstrates an emerging understanding of how to combine and condense ideas and would benefit from explicit instruction on how to use more formal language choices to combine and condense ideas within an argument. In addition, specific instruction on sentence structure would support the student in understanding the difference between complete sentences and run-on sentences. Additional support could focus on the correct and consistent use of punctuation and capitalization.

Overview of Student's Performance

Across the Performance Task, the student demonstrates an emerging understanding of how to read closely, form an effective argument, and connect ideas through a text. The student's responses to the research questions suggest that he or she could benefit from additional support in unpacking prompts and understanding specifically what complex items are asking. The student also shows an emerging understanding of how to create a logical relationship between the constructed responses and the full write; the student would benefit from instruction on integrated information from the constructed responses into the full write. It is likely that the student does not fully understand the texts, which indicates that further instruction on close reading and text analysis would benefit the student. The student includes plenty of evidence from the sources, and demonstrates an emerging understanding of how to integrate evidence into a cohesive argument.

Next Steps

The student would benefit from targeted instruction on close reading of complex texts, analyzing the prompt, creating a focused claim, and selecting, explaining, and citing quality evidence to support that claim.

Specifically, the student would benefit from instruction on how to engage with and comprehend complex texts. For example, the student could be provided support in how to read and analyze texts in smaller segments, interacting with the text through annotations and highlighting. The student could be taught metacognitive "fix-up" strategies to increase reading comprehension and to use available tools to determine the meaning of unknown words in texts. Additionally, the student would benefit from engaging in activities (with moderate support) that focus on the language typical of informational texts. This type of instruction would support the student to better comprehend complex texts and also would support the student in constructing cohesive arguments.

The student would also benefit from targeted instruction on close reading of questions and prompts. Guided practice could focus on carefully analyzing prompts; identifying, defining, and highlighting key terms to ensure understanding of the task; and outlining a central claim and supporting evidence.

Instruction should also address how to select evidence that best supports the claim. The student would benefit from modeling of how to determine a position and phrase the claim effectively. Classroom activities could include having students verbally debate high-interest topics in order to build knowledge on the topic of the argument, followed by a collaborative writing activity in which students jointly construct their argument. Additionally, instruction should focus on the features and structure of argument writing as well as the typical organizational structure and language features of argumentative texts (possibly supported with a graphic organizer).

The student would also benefit from focused instruction on selecting appropriate evidence, analyzing the evidence for meaning, and citing sources. Once the student has learned how to establish a position, the student may need instruction on how to choose and evaluate evidence related to that position. The student may benefit from categorizing the provided relevant and irrelevant evidence based on a claim, followed by choosing evidence from a text with support and evaluating that evidence. After analyzing the evidence, the student may need support explaining the relevance of each piece of evidence to the argument. Analysis of mentor texts, followed by joint construction of an argument, would support the student in being able to independently craft an argument.

The student also needs access to models of correct citation and punctuation. Following the writing process during which the student concentrates on one area of refinement at a time (e.g., sentence formation) would allow the student to be successful without

CONTINUED ON PAGE 7

CONTINUED FROM PAGE 6

feeling overwhelmed. Additionally, looking closely at the language of mentor texts in guided lessons would apprentice the student into understanding how to read and write different text types.

Since this student is an English learner and has an IEP, the student has been provided with instruction on how to use key accessibility features of the testing software. However, this student might have benefited from additional accessibility features and it is worth a careful review of the Smarter Balanced Usability, Accessibility, and Accommodations Guidelines to ensure that the student is accessing all relevant, available supports. In addition, the student could have used additional practice with the testing software as well as additional practice completing assignments that mimic a performance task.