

Grade 5 / Case Study 2

→ ELA * SMARTER BALANCED PERFORMANCE TASK

Research
Question 1
ITEM #2646

Click on the boxes to match each source with the idea or ideas that it supports. Some ideas may have more than one source selected.

Student
Response
ITEM #2646

KEY
X = student response
✓ = correct response

	SOURCE #1 Monkey Helpers	SOURCE #2 Animals Helping People	SOURCE #3 New Service Animal Rules
People who own businesses have to consider the well-being of all of their guests.			X ✓
Being smart and able to handle small objects makes certain animals more appropriate than other animals to assist people who have a disability.	X ✓	X ✓	

Analysis
ITEM #2646

This student response would receive a score level of 1 out of a possible 1 point because all 3 cells are completed correctly. The student has selected all of the possible correct answers. The student correctly identifies that Source #3 discusses the idea that business owners must consider the well-being of their guests. In addition, the student correctly identifies that Source #1 and Source #2 include the idea that certain animals are more appropriate than others to assist the disabled as a result of their intelligence and ability to handle small objects. This response demonstrates that the student can recall information he or she has read and can infer the intended meaning from such reading. Neither of the two idea options are direct quotations from the source material; instead, all three are conceptual ideas that the student must deduce from the reading.

Research Question 2

ITEM #2647

The sources discuss how service animals help people. Explain what you have learned about how service animals help people. Use **one** detail from Source #1 and **one** detail from Source #2 to support your explanation. For each detail, include the source title or number.

Student Response

ITEM #2647

I have learned many things about how service animals can help humans. Before the reading, I only thought dogs were service animals. Now I know that monkeys, horses, and other animals are qualified too. In source 1, I learned that monkeys could be, and are service animals. It didn't make sense at first, but now I know why disabled people might want a monkey. First of all, monkeys have fingers which is useful to them during tasks. "Along with operating microwaves and DVD players, these service animals can also turn lights off and on for their new owners. They can open bottles and flip the pages of a book for their owner."

In source 2, I kind of got the big picture. It talked all about different types of service animals, such as dogs and monkeys. But what really stood out to me was the dolphins. I thought it was interesting how the dolphins could calm the kids with the physical and learning disabilities. Also, I thought that the service dogs were even more helpful because they can help the def, blind, and paralyzed. "This boy needs both his hands and all his energy to walk. Luckily, his assistance dog is there to carry his backpack."

Analysis

ITEM #2647

This student response would receive a score level of 2 out of 2 possible points because it provides two pieces of evidence from different sources that support the idea that service animals help people; both of the sources are cited. In addition, this student explains how each detail supports this big idea.

The first cited evidence comes from Source #1. The student selects a sentence from the source material to quote how monkeys can assist their owner. The student then clearly states how this detail supports the big idea. The second piece of cited evidence comes from Source #2, and the student selects a sentence from the source material to quote how assistance dogs can assist disabled children. The student then clearly states how service dogs are helpful.

This student includes a third piece of evidence and states that it comes from Source #2. While a sentence from the source is not quoted, it is paraphrased. The student says, "I thought it was interesting how the dolphins could calm the kids with the physical and learning disabilities." The student does not elaborate on this detail or explain how it connects to the big idea. However, by selecting this concept, the student demonstrates a connection to the big idea; how calming children can be helpful.

The student demonstrates the ability to locate in the reading and integrate into the writing two details from two different sources that support the idea of service animals helping people. In this response, the student demonstrates the ability to appropriately cite as well as paraphrase details from the source material. This again highlights this student's ability to read closely to comprehend complex informational texts and to analyze and integrate information.

<p>Research Question 3 ITEM #2648</p>	<p>Which source would most likely be the most helpful in understanding how a service animal is trained? Explain why this source is most likely the most helpful. Give at least two details from the source to support your answer.</p>
<p>Student Response ITEM #2648</p>	<p>I think that source 1 would most likely be the best qualified source for training animals. If you take a look at the section, "Learning to Help," you will see that it talks about the Helping Hands program. "Every day, for 3-5 years, capuchin monkeys learn new skills." The Helping Hands foundation is like a college for monkeys.</p> <p>"Days are spent learning how to load a dvd into the player and push play or how to open or close microwave doors." Those 2 reasons were why I picked source 1. All the other sources talk about different animals and new safety regulations. But bits and peices of source 1 talk about training.</p>
<p>Analysis ITEM #2648</p>	<p>This student response would receive a score level of 2 out of 2 possible points since the response correctly identifies the most helpful source. It includes two details from the source that provide support. In addition, it explains why this source is most likely the most helpful.</p> <p>This student has correctly identified Source #1 as being the most helpful source in understanding how a service animal is trained.</p> <p>The first cited detail from Source #1 refers to the Helping Hands Program. The student quotes a sentence that describes how monkeys learn new skills in this program. The student quotes another sentence from this same source for the second cited detail about how these monkeys learn how to load a DVD player, push play, and open or close microwave doors. The student notes that these details were taken from the source materials under the section "Learning to Help." The student has used the text structure (sub-headings) of the source material as a guide to help find information.</p> <p>The student concludes with a clear analysis of why this source is most likely the most helpful. The student says, "All the other sources talk about different animals and new safety regulations. But bits and pieces of Source #1 talk about training."</p> <p>The student correctly identifies which source would be the most helpful, indicating that he or she has closely read all three sources and understand the main concepts noted in each. In addition, the student again shows an ability to locate and appropriately cite relevant details from the sources to support the response, and the student uses text structure to help them do so. Attention to detail is evident as this student provides a thorough response, including an analysis of why this source is the most helpful.</p>

Full Write * ITEM #2649

Full Write –
Student
Response
ITEM #2649**Opinion about Service animals**

Today, I was asked to pick a side about the new service animal rules and regulations. I strongly believe that the new rules are better, more safe, and more helpful compared to the old rules. Let me explain why.

It specifically states in source 3 lines 15-25 that, "people were allowed to choose any service animal as helpers, including pigs, birds, and lizards!" So, does that mean that if I were disabled, I could have a Gila Monster? Pretty much – Yes. The new laws prohibit anything that dangerous happening, because the animals have been limited to dogs and small horses.

Let me add on to how dangerous it is to have a pet snake or lizard. I get that it might make the disabled person feel comfy and cozy. But if you brought a snake or other creature into, let's say, a coffee shop, how would that make passerby feel? Probably not so good.

Also, there is always the possibility of the service animal attacking. If you get attacked by a dog, no big deal. Now, let's pretend that the dog is now a snake attacking. You could possibly die (I am not using snakes for any particular reason).

This is what really gives me the chills. Let's say, a paralyzed man has a pet monkey. There is no way in knowing if that monkey is going to attack or not. If it did attack, the paralyzed man would have no way to protect himself. Even though it only could happen, it is always good to be on the safe side.

I strongly believe that if the A.D.A. did not make that law, we would be in a pretty tight situation. If I owned a store, I would not want monkeys and birds coming through my door. I think that the new rules are better for all of us. I personally would love to hear the other side of the story because right now, there is nothing that could change my mind.

To conclude, I would like to say that I strongly believe that A.D.A.'s new rules and regulations are better, more safe, and more helpful compared to the old rules.

Analysis of Full Write

ITEM #2649

Organization and Purpose: Score 3

The full write essay indicates that the student understands how to organize and establish purpose for an opinion paper. This response has an evident organizational structure and sense of completeness that is adequately sustained across the full write. The minor flaws that keep it from being consistently and purposefully focused do not interfere with the overall coherence. The student sets up an organizational structure to provide support to the three reasons noted in the introduction and summarized in the conclusion, but there is no part of the essay dedicated to discussing how the A.D.A.'s new rules are "more helpful." As such, the introduction and conclusion could be stronger to anchor the paper and to fully set the reader up to enter and exit the writer's response. The progression of ideas and transitions used across the paper could be made stronger to clarify the relationships between and among ideas.

Evidence and Elaboration: Score 2

The full write response provides uneven and cursory support for the opinion and insufficient use of source material. The student attempts to support the opinion with evidence from only one of the possible sources, and does not select the most effective detail to cite from that source. Furthermore, the student elaborates on details from the sources using an overabundance of personal opinions and interpretation: "If it did attack, the paralyzed man would have no way to protect himself. Even though it only could happen, it is always good to be on the safe side." The student's writing style is evident, and techniques are used help to engage the reader. However, the student could use more precise vocabulary to strengthen his or her stance.

Conventions: Score 2

There is an adequate command of conventions across this full write. Holistically, this response has minimal errors that are only high-level and not significant, proportionally, to the amount of writing completed.

Overview of Student's Performance

It is evident that this student understands the expectations of this Service Animal Opinion Performance Task, including how to respond to the research questions and how to write a paper expressing an opinion about the new service animal rule. The student demonstrates an ability to scan, read, comprehend, and cite details from the sources as evidenced by their thorough written answers to the research questions.

Analysis of the student's full write in all three writing dimension, shows that the student can adequately establish a purpose for an opinion essay, organize ideas and correctly employ conventions of written English. However, when looking deeper at the response in each dimension, it is clear that this student would have benefited from spending time before writing organizing ideas in support of his/her opinion and determining which evidence from the sources would best provide that support.

The research questions show that this student can read, comprehend, select and cite appropriate details to connect to their opinion; however, this does not carry over into the full write. For example, the student fails to provide support in the full write for the idea

that the new rules are “more helpful”, but in Research Question 2, the student cites many examples of ways animals are helpful. This student has the skill to find and use significant evidence, but needs support in connecting it across the performance task.

Furthermore, the student's response to Research Question 3 reveals that the student demonstrates the ability to use appropriate elaborative techniques; however, this is not seen in the full write where the student relies heavily on personal opinion and interpretation. This student is developing the ability to elaborate but needs to have guidance and practice in crafting with this technique in a longer response.

Next Steps

This student would benefit from continued practice with closely reading sets of topic-connected, increasingly complex texts in varying genres, and then citing and paraphrasing and integrating details from these sources into their written responses to literal and inferential text-dependent questions. In this performance task, the student effectively exhibits these skills with the research questions; however, the student does not use the same strategies effectively in their full write response. As such, the student needs practice learning how to organize their response before writing to ensure a solid introduction, supportive paragraphs, and a conclusion that ends with impact. Having opportunities to explore strong examples of opinion writing, analyze prompts, and brainstorm options for responses, and outline ideas using a graphic organizer, will position the student to better respond to the performance task. The student should also engage in mini-lessons to bolster skills in writing stronger introduction and conclusion paragraphs. In addition, the student would benefit from lessons on how to keep ideas flowing across the essay and within paragraphs through the use of transitions. Generating a list of possible transitions to refer to may be beneficial. Finally, this student would greatly benefit from instruction on how to sandwich cited quotations and/or paraphrased details whereby the student states an opinion, provides a relevant cited detail from the source material, and closes with an explanation of how this detail connects to the opinion.

Other next steps can be noted, but serve to provide more generalized development for the student beyond the specifics of the performance task: lessons on sentence formation (including correct punctuation and grammar usage); opportunities to enhance vocabulary development and advance spelling knowledge; and lessons on how to develop style in writing.